

MINUTES

SAN DIEGO COUNTY PLANNING COMMISSION

Regular Meeting – March 5, 2004

DPLU Hearing Room, 9:00 a.m.

The meeting convened at 9:02 a.m., recessed at 10:35 a.m., reconvened at 10:51 a.m., and adjourned at 12:25 p.m.

ROLL CALL

Commissioners Present: Beck, Brooks, Day, Edwards, Kreitzer, Miller

Commissioners Absent: Woods

Advisors Present: Beech (DPW); Taylor (OCC)

Staff Present: Pryor, Hulse, Carmichael, Russell, Swaby, Jones
(recording secretary)

1. Director's Report:

There are no Board of Supervisors actions to report.

GP 2020 Staff is preparing to return to the Board of Supervisors in April 2004. They have modeled the traffic impacts for the seven scenarios as directed by the Board. With respect to groundwater studies, a Countywide study modeled for impacts on groundwater and groundwater conditions will be performed, in addition to a separate study for Borrego Springs.

2. Public Requests:

Opportunity for members of the public to speak to the Commission on any subject matter within the Commission's jurisdiction but not an item on today's agenda.

Mitchell Gaol from El Cajon voices his concerns about the negative impacts and Major Use Permit violations associated with an existing rock crushing operation in Crest on Mountain View Road. He alleges that the operators allow excess trucking, uncovered loads, dirt and gravel spills, work performed beyond the approved hours of operation, illegal grading, excessive noise and impacts on the arroyo toad. Staff is requested to report back to the Commission on the concerns raised by Mr. Chagall.

3. Approval of Minutes: None.

Administrative:

**March 5, 2004
Page 2**

P96-011W²:

4. Rancho San Diego YMCA, Major Use Permit Modification P96-011W², Valle de Oro Community Planning Area

Proposed Major Use Permit Modification (P96-011W²) to allow the phased development of the YMCA Rancho San Diego recreation facility. The facility will initially consist of a lighted multi-purpose ball field, a lighted outdoor sports rink, a freestanding restroom facility, temporary freestanding modular offices with a youth center and parking lot. The second phase of the recreation facility will include a 35,485 square-foot recreation building with a gymnasium, aquatic center, health and fitness center, administrative offices, a lighted skateboard park, basketball court and additional parking.

Also requested is an exception to the height requirements for a portion of the YMCA building, to permit a roof height of 51 feet (mid-point roof peak and roof eave) and to allow field lights at a height of 79 feet. In addition, an exception to the Planned Development setback requirements is being requested for the placement of temporary freestanding portable offices. The project site is subject to Site Plan review in accordance with Section 2801 of the Zoning Ordinance, and is also subject to the "F" Floodplain Designator. The 9.3-acre project site is located off of Campo Road between Jamacha and Millar Ranch Roads behind the existing Rancho San Diego Town Center shopping center. The project has a General Plan Land Use Designation of (21) Specific Plan Area and (24) Impact Sensitive, and zoning on the site consists of S80 Open Space and S88 Specific Planning Area within the adopted Rancho San Diego Specific Planning Area.

Staff Presentation: Farace

Proponents: 39; **Opponents:** 1

Though the Valle de Oro Planning Group supported the proposal in 1997, its representative now recommends denial of the proposed Modification because of potential visual and wildlife impacts and lighting on the ballfields and the skate park. The Group chairman also expresses concerns about archaeological impacts and his belief that the project is inconsistent with the Community Plan. He explains that the applicant made no mention in 1997 of providing lighting, and the EIR didn't analyze lighting impacts. He reminds the Commission that this is the most sensitive environmental area in the community, with a nationally significant archaeological site, convergence of two major floodplains, riparian wildlife and habitat for the least

P96-011W²:

Bell's vireo. The Group chairman believes the proposed lighting will cause significant visual impacts for existing wildlife, and impacts on the Kumeyaay village archaeological site. He insists that the proposed mitigation of one-gallon trees will not have any mitigable effect on lighting impacts. If the Planning Commission decides to approve this project, the Planning Group chairman requests that the exterior field lighting isn't used; the lights are to be extinguished at 9:30 p.m.; the exterior lighting doesn't exceed the values on the plot plan; the specified tree plants should be 30 inches minimum; the building height is limited to 40 feet; etched marble monuments are to be installed around the entire archaeological site denoting its presence and national significance; and trenching for drainage facilities in the archaeological site should not exceed two feet in depth.

Commissioner Beck notes that capping over archaeological sites is a common practice, and questions whether the Planning Group supported that procedure during discussions on the initial project. It is explained that the Group supported capping with the understanding that future research would occur.

Staff clarifies that the archaeological site was preserved and capped when it was first presented to DPLU. Staff agrees that the site is a very important Kumeyaay village, and has ensured that no additional impacts will occur. Quite a bit of the site is available for research, and Staff expects a number of collections will be formed. In addition, an archaeological monitor will be onsite during development to ensure compliance with the Use Permit Conditions.

Staff explains that the use of ballfield and parking lights was already approved. Staff has researched the proposed lighting and consulted with representatives of Fish and Wildlife. It was subsequently concluded that the provision of additional trees will negate any potential impacts. Staff has also analyzed noise levels, and determined that a berm should be provided along the skate park to minimize any possible noise pollution.

The vast majority of those in attendance today voice the need for the proposed improvements and support for the project as proposed, and state their belief that it will benefit the community's young people. Following public testimony, Commissioner Kreitzer reminds Staff that one-gallon trees are incredibly small, and questions whether mesh screening could be provided as an additional shield for the proposed lighting. Staff explains that the proposed lighting is similar to that found in parking areas, and 15-gallon and 24-inch box trees will be provided.

Commissioner Brooks notes that the Major Use Permit Modification indicates that an open channel is being proposed. Staff explains that this was necessary to obtain

P96-011W²:

the 404 Permit. Commissioner Edwards notes that the open channel could be a nice amenity if it's properly maintained. He also notes that the project site abuts a shopping center, with no residences for 200 or 300 yards. Commissioner Day poses a number of questions to Staff regarding access to the skate park, enforcement of Use Permit Conditions, trenching and noise, and is assured by Staff that all of these issues have been addressed in the Use Permit Modification and will be enforced. Commissioner Day states he is very familiar with the project site and compliments the Planning Group representative for paying such close attention to the development of this site. He believes the pertinent issues have been fully analyzed and the proposal will provide a tremendous benefit Countywide. He commends the applicant for working so closely with the community, announces that he supports approval of the project, and recommends that the applicant meet with representatives of the Kumeyaay tribe to determine how best to denote the significance of the Kumeyaay Tribes and their contributions to San Diego County's history.

Staff reassures Commissioner Brooks that the access path is properly maintained, and Commissioner Beck urges Staff to include Conditions in the Major Use Permit Modification allowing for future research of the site. Commissioner Beck also states his belief that Staff has incorrectly interpreted Valle de Oro's Community Plan. He agrees that the proposed lighting reduces impacts, but the YMCA is a recreational facility, and the proposed Modification is 30% taller than other structure in the neighborhood. The applicant's representative explains that the additional height is necessary for the basketball area.

With respect to the monument discussed by the Planning Group representative, Staff states a rotating display discussing the significance of the Kumeyaay village could be provided. Staff supports allowing the facility to operate until 11:00 p.m.

Action: Edwards – Miller

Grant Major Use Permit Modification P96-011W², which makes the appropriate Findings and includes those requirements and Conditions necessary to ensure that the project is implemented in a manner consistent with The Zoning Ordinance. Fifteen-gallon and 24-inch box trees are to be installed and monitored for five years, and it is recommended that the applicant meet with the Native Americans per Commissioner Day's recommendation.

Discussion of the Action:

P96-011W²:

Staff informs the Commission that the applicant will be required to furnish reports from a licensed landscape architect upon receipt of the Landscape Plan. Also, per Commissioner Beck, the applicant is encouraged to work with representatives of the Kumeyaay Tribe and the Valle de Oro Planning Group to develop an appropriate identification marker or monument and protocols for future research, such as curation and public education. In addition, the applicant is to work with the San Diego Archaeology Center and the Kumeyaay Coalition to establish a permanent rotating display.

Commissioner Day supports the requirements for a permanent marker or monument, but is not supportive of the requirement for an artifact display. Staff believes this can be resolved through discussions amongst the applicants, the Kumeyaay Tribe and the Planning Group representatives. Commissioner Beck directs that invasive plant species be eliminated from the drainage channel, and is informed that Staff will notify representatives of DPW's Flood Control Department, who are responsible for such actions.

Ayes:	6 -	Beck, Brooks, Day, Edwards, Kreitzer, Miller
Noes:	0 -	None
Abstain:	1 -	Woods
Absent:	1 -	None

5. Report on actions of Planning Commission's Subcommittees.

There were none.

6. Designation of member to represent the Planning Commission at Board of Supervisors meeting(s):

No designates were selected.

7. Discussion of correspondence received by the Planning Commission:

There was none.

8. Scheduled Meetings:

March 19, 2004	Regular Meeting, DPLU Hearing Room, 9:00 a.m.
April 2, 2004	Regular Meeting, DPLU Hearing Room, 9:00 a.m.
April 16, 2004	Regular Meeting, DPLU Hearing Room, 9:00 a.m.
April 30, 2004	Planning Commission Workshop, DPLU Hearing Room, 9:00 a.m.
May 14, 2004	Regular Meeting, DPLU Hearing Room, 9:00 a.m.
May 28, 2004	Regular Meeting, DPLU Hearing Room, 9:00 a.m.
June 11, 2004	Regular Meeting, DPLU Hearing Room, 9:00 a.m.
July 9, 2004	Regular Meeting, DPLU Hearing Room, 9:00 a.m.
July 23, 2004	Regular Meeting, DPLU Hearing Room, 9:00 a.m.
August 6, 2004	Regular Meeting, DPLU Hearing Room, 9:00 a.m.
August 20, 2004	Regular Meeting, DPLU Hearing Room, 9:00 a.m.
September 3, 2004	Regular Meeting, DPLU Hearing Room, 9:00 a.m.
September 17, 2004	Regular Meeting, DPLU Hearing Room, 9:00 a.m.
October 1, 2004	Regular Meeting, DPLU Hearing Room, 9:00 a.m.
October 15, 2004	Regular Meeting, DPLU Hearing Room, 9:00 a.m.
October 29, 2004	Planning Commission Workshop, DPLU Hearing Room, 9:00 a.m.
November 5, 2004	Regular Meeting, DPLU Hearing Room, 9:00 a.m.

There being no further business to be considered at this time, the Chairperson adjourned the meeting at 12:25 p.m. to 9:00 a.m. on March 19, 2004 in the DPLU Hearing Room, 5201 Ruffin Road, Suite B, San Diego, California.